Civilian Police Oversight Agency Board

Chantal M. Galloway, Chair Jesse Crawford
Dr. William J. Kass Eric Nixon
Diane McDermott, Interim Executive Director

Patricia J. French

Thursday, December 9, 2021 - 5:00 p.m.

Members Present:

Chantal M. Galloway, Chair Jesse Crawford (late) Patricia J. French Dr. William Kass Eric Nixon

Members Absent:

Others Present:

Diane McDermott, CPOA Katrina Sigala, CPOA Valerie Barela, CPOA Tina Gooch, Atty Acting Cdr. Richard Evans, APD Acting Cdr. Jason Sanchez, APD Elizabeth Martinez, DOJ Jared Hager, DOJ Ian Stoker, Asst. City Atty. Carlos Pacheco, Sr. Managing City Atty Chris Sylvan, City Council Pastor David Walker, Mayor's Office Kelly Mensah, CPC Marteessa Billy, CPC Roy Turpen, CPC Teresa Garcia, CPC Wanda Harrison, CPC Adreaon Williams, Perspective Board Appointee Princess Coleman Mike Kruchoski Renee Montoya Janice C. Steve Perea

Attendance: In response to the Public Health Emergency, the Civilian Police Oversight Agency (CPOA) Board meeting on Thursday, December 9, 2021 at 5:00 pm will be held via Zoom video conference.

Viewing: Members of the public will have the ability to view the meeting through GOVTV on Comcast Channel 16, or to stream live on the GOVTV website at: https://www.cabq.gov/culturalservices/govtv, or on YouTube at: https://www.cabq.gov/cpoa/events/cpoa-board-meeting-12-09-2021.

(Please note that the link for YouTube has not yet been generated, however, the link could easily be found on the link provided above prior to the start of the meeting). The GOVTV live stream can be accessed at these addresses from most smartphones, tablets, or computers.

The video recording of this and all past meetings of the CPOA Board will also remain available for viewing at any time on the CPOA's website. CPOA Staff is available to help members of the public access pre-recorded CPOA meetings on-line at any time during normal business hours. Please email CPOA@cabq.gov for assistance.

Public Comment: The agenda for the meeting will be posted on the CPOA website by 5:00 p.m., Monday, December 6, 2021 at www.cabq.gov/cpoa.

The CPOA Board will take general public comment and comment on the meeting's specific agenda items in written form via email through 4:00 pm on Thursday, December 9, 2021. Submit your public comments to: POB@cabq.gov. These comments will be distributed to all CPOA Board members for review.

Minutes

- I. Welcome and call to order. Chair Galloway called to order the regular meeting of the Civilian Police Oversight Agency Board at 5:01 p.m. Chair Galloway announced the resignations of Chair Eric Olivas, Member Armijo-Prewitt and Member Ralph and acknowledged them for their service and the time they dedicated to serve on the CPOA Board.
- II. Mission Statement. Chair Galloway read aloud the Civilian Police Oversight Agency Board's mission statement.
- III. Approval of the Agenda
 - **a. Motion.** Motion by Member Kass to approve the agenda as amended. Roll call vote taken. Motion passed.

For: 4 - French, Galloway, Kass, Nixon

b. Motion. A second motion by Member Kass to amend the agenda and that item XI.o. CPOA Board Subcommittee Assignments be heard as the first Discussion and Possible Action item XI.a. Roll call vote taken. Motion passed.

For: 4 - French, Galloway, Kass, Nixon

c. Motion. A third motion by Chair Galloway to remove discussion item Member Review Process – Member Ralph from XI.q. Roll call vote taken. Motion passed.

For: 4 - French, Galloway, Kass, Nixon

IV. Public Comments

- **a.** Geraldine Amato (attached)
- **b.** Jim Larson (attached)

Civilian Police Oversight Agency Board Minutes – December 9, 2021 Page 2 V. For more information about minutes from prior CPOA Board meetings, please visit our website here: http://www.cabq.gov/cpoa/police-oversight-board/pobagenda-meeting-minutes

a. Review and Approval of Minutes from November 4, 2021. Draft minutes from the Civilian Police Oversight Board November 4, 2021 regular meeting was distributed to each Board Member electronically via a weblink.

b. Motion. A motion a by Member Dr. Kass to approve the minutes as written and that the minutes be modified to reflect that Member Armijo-Prewitt's absence was excused and attended the Citizen Police Academy on the final. Roll call vote taken. Motion passed.

For: 4 - French, Galloway, Kass, Nixon

c. Motion. A motion by Chair Galloway to suspend CPOA Policies and Procedure rules for the purposes of modifying the December 9, 2021 Board agenda and omitting the standing items Reports from City Departments and Subcommittee Reports. Roll call vote taken. Motion passed.

For: 4 - French, Galloway, Kass, Nixon

VI. Requests for Reconsideration

a. 030-21

1. Motion. A motion by Chair Galloway to deny request for reconsideration for CPC 030-21. Roll call vote taken. Motion failed.

For: 2 – Galloway, Kass

Against: 2 - French, Nixon

2. Motion. A second motion by Member Dr. Kass to grant request for reconsideration for CPC 030-21. Roll call vote taken. Motion failed.

For: 2 – French, Nixon

Against: 2 - Galloway, Kass

- **3.** CPOA Legal Counsel Tina Gooch read aloud the criteria on requests for reconsideration set forth in the CPOA Policies and Procedures.
- **4. Motion.** A third motion by Member Nixon to table CPC 030-21 to the next regularly scheduled CPOA Board meeting. Roll call vote taken. Motion passed.

For: 4 - French, Galloway, Kass, Nixon

b. 101-21

 Motion. A motion by Chair Galloway to deny request for reconsideration for CPC 101-21. Roll call vote taken. Motion passed.

For: 4 - French, Galloway, Kass, Nixon

c. 122-21

1. Motion. A motion by Member Nixon to grant the request for reconsideration for CPC 122-21. Roll call vote taken. Motion failed.

For: 1 - Nixon

Against: 3 - French, Galloway, Kass

2. Motion. A second motion by Member Nixon to request a letter from the CAO on the status of CPC 122-21. Roll call vote taken. Motion passed.

For: 4 - French, Galloway, Kass, Nixon

VII. Request to Re-open Administratively Closed Case

a. 115-21

1. Motion. A motion by Chair Galloway to deny the request to re-open Administratively Closed Case CPC 115-21 at this time and that the complainant be notified of the proper procedure to request re-opening of a case. Roll call vote taken. Motion passed.

Civilian Police Oversight Agency Board Minutes – December 9, 2021 Page 4

For: 4 - French, Galloway, Kass, Nixon

VIII. Review of Cases:

a. Administratively Closed

138-21 131-21 164-21

1. Complainant for CPC 138-21 attended the meeting and provided a statement.

Member Crawford joined the meeting at 5:56 p.m.

2. Motion. Motion by Member Nixon to accept the findings of Administratively Closed cases CPC 138-21, 131-21 and 164-21. Roll call vote taken. Motion passed.

For: 5 - Crawford, French, Galloway, Kass, Nixon

b. Exonerated

153-21

- 1. Complainant for CPC 153-21 attended the meeting and provided a statement.
- **2. Motion.** A motion by Member Kass to accept the findings of Exonerated case CPC 153-21. Roll call vote taken. Motion passed.

For: 5 - Crawford, French, Galloway, Kass, Nixon

c. Sustained and Sustained Violation NBOOC

155-21

1. Motion. A motion by Member Galloway to accept the findings of Sustained and Sustained Violation Not Based on Original Complaint case CPC 155-21. Roll call vote taken. Motion passed.

For: 5 - Crawford, French, Galloway, Kass, Nixon

d. Sustained Violation NBOOC, Exonerated, Unfounded and Administratively Closed

148-21

 Motion. A motion by Member French to accept Sustained Violation Not Based on Original Complaint, Exonerated, Unfounded and Administratively Closed case CPC 148-21. Roll call vote taken. Motion passed.

For: 5 - Crawford, French, Galloway, Kass, Nixon

e. Sustained Violation NBOOC, Exonerated and Administratively Closed

140-21

 Motion. A motion by Member Nixon to accept the findings of Sustained Violation Not Based on Original Complaint, Exonerated and Administratively Closed case CPC 140-21. Roll call vote taken. Motion passed.

For: 5 - Crawford, French, Galloway, Kass, Nixon

f. Sustained, Not Sustained and Unfounded

134-21 149-21

 Motion. A motion by Member Nixon to accept the findings of Sustained, Not Sustained and Unfounded cases CPC 134-21 and 149-21. Roll call vote taken. Motion passed.

For: 5 - Crawford, French, Galloway, Kass, Nixon

g. Unfounded

145-21 146-21 154-21 158-21 215-21

- 1. Complainant for CPC 215-21 attended the meeting and provided a statement.
- **2. Motion.** A motion by member Dr. Kass to accept the findings of Unfounded cases CPC 145-21, 146-21, 154-21, 158-21 and 215-21. Roll call vote taken. Motion passed.

For: 5 - Crawford, French, Galloway, Kass, Nixon

h. Unfounded and Exonerated

135-21 137-21 147-21

 Motion. A motion by Chair Galloway to accept to findings of Unfounded and Exonerated Cases CPC 135-21, 137-21 and 147-21.
 Roll call vote taken. Motion passed.

IX. Non-Concurrence Cases

- a. CPC 067-21
- b. CPC 095-21
 - Chair Galloway noted receipt of Non-Concurrences Cases CPC 067-21 and 095-21.

X. Serious Use of Force Cases/Officer Involved Shooting

a. 20-0015405 HC

- 1. Member Dr. Kass provided a summary of Serious Use of Force Case 20-0015405.
- **2. Motion.** A motion by Member Dr. Kass to accept the findings of the APD Force Review Board. Roll call vote taken. Motion passed.

For: 5 - Crawford, French, Galloway, Kass, Nixon

b. 20-0017623

- 1. Member Dr. Kass provided a summary of Serious Use of Force Case 20-0017623.
- **2. Motion.** A motion by Member Dr. Kass to accept the findings of the APD Force Review Board. Roll call vote taken. Motion passed.

For: 5 - Crawford, French, Galloway, Kass, Nixon

c. 20-0037586

- 1. Member Dr. Kass provided a summary of Serious Use of Force Case 20-0037586.
- **2. Motion.** A motion by Member Dr. Kass to accept the findings of the APD Force Review Board. Roll call vote taken. Motion passed.

For: 5 - Crawford, French, Galloway, Kass, Nixon

d. 20-0043667

- 1. Member Dr. Kass provided a summary of Serious Use of Force Case 20-0043667.
- **2. Motion.** A motion by Member Dr. Kass to accept the findings of the APD Force Review Board. Roll call vote taken. Motion passed.

For: 5 - Crawford, French, Galloway, Kass, Nixon

Civilian Police Oversight Agency Board Minutes – December 9, 2021 Page 7

e. 20-0044826 OIS

- 1. Member Dr. Kass provided a summary of Officer Involved Shooting Case 20-0044826.
- **2. Motion.** A motion by Member Dr. Kass to accept the findings of the APD Force Review Board. Roll call vote taken. Motion passed.

For: 5 - Crawford, French, Galloway, Kass, Nixon

f. 19-0077270 OIS

1. Motion. A motion my Member Dr. Kass to table until more information becomes available. Roll call vote taken. Motion passed.

For: 5 - Crawford, French, Galloway, Kass, Nixon

2. Chair Galloway will follow up with Member Dr. Kass before the next CPOA Board meeting on the status.

g. File Requests:

- 1. 18-0058242 OIS Investigation File
- 2. 21-0013737 OIS Investigation File
- ii. Motion. A motion by Member Dr. Kass to request the Officer Involved Shooting Investigation Files for 18-0058242 and 21-0013737 from IAFD. Roll call vote taken. Motion passed.

For: 5 - Crawford, French, Galloway, Kass, Nixon

h. Proposed Case(s) for January 2022 Review:

- 1. 16-0003286
- 2. 19-0051831
- 3. 20-0007132
- 4. 20-0009417
- 5. 20-0031830
- 6. 20-0042176
- 7. 20-0055810
 - *** A Twenty-minute break began at 8:00 p.m. and the meeting reconvened at 8:21 p.m.***

XI. Discussion and Possible Action:

- a. CPOA Board Subcommittee Assignments Chantal Galloway
 - 1. Chair Galloway recommends to postpone all subcommittees scheduled for the remainder of December 2022.
- b. Consideration of PPRB Policies with No Recommendation: -

Dr. William Kass

1. Motion. A motion by Member Dr. Kass to accept the list of PPRB Policies with No Recommendation (*see attached*). Roll call vote taken. Motion passed.

For: 5 - Crawford, French, Galloway, Kass, Nixon

- c. Traffic Stops Data Request Dr. William Kass
 - 1. Motion. A motion by Member Dr. Kass in a letter to the Chief Harold Medina dated June 7, 2021, the CPOA Board requested data regarding traffic stops. To date, these data have not been provided. The CPOA Board authorizes the Policy and Procedures Review Subcommittee to pursue following up on the request. Roll call vote taken. Motion passed.

For: 5 - Crawford, French, Galloway, Kass, Nixon

- d. Consideration of Proposed Changes to SOP 3-41 Complaints
 Involving Department Personnel *Patricia French*
 - **1. Motion.** A motion by Member Nixon to approve the letter as drafted. (*see attached*). Roll call vote taken. Motion passed.

Member French lost internet connection at 8:49 p.m. and reconnected at 8:50 p.m.

For: 5 - Crawford, French, Galloway, Kass, Nixon

e. Consideration of Proposed MOU between the City of Albuquerque, CPOA/CPOAB and APOA on OIS/SUOF Materials – *Tina Gooch*, *CPOA Counsel*

1. Motion. A motion by Chair Galloway to approve the MOU as drafted and that the draft be sent to APOA. (*see attached*) Roll call vote taken. Motion passed.

For: 5 – Crawford, French, Galloway, Kass, Nixon

f. Non-Concurrence Letter to APD Update – Eric Nixon

- **1.** Member Nixon provided an update on the Non-Concurrence Letter to APD.
- 2. Diane McDermott Interim Director also provided an update on the response from IA and that they are working on correcting the Non-Concurrence cases and she will provide an update at the next regularly scheduled CPOA Board meeting.

g. IMR-14 and Letter to the Court – Eric Olivas and Tina Gooch, CPOA Counsel

1. **Motion.** A motion by Chair Galloway to accept the edited draft of the IMR-14 Letter to the Court and to delegate CPOA Legal Counsel and herself to submit the letter to the Court. (*see attached*) Roll call vote taken. Motion passed.

For: 5 - Crawford, French, Galloway, Kass, Nixon

2. The CPOA Board modified the Letter in real time to comply with the submission deadline.

h. CPOA Ordinance Changes and CRC Ordinance Recommendations – Patricia French

- Member French provided an update on the status of the CPOA
 Ordinance Changes and that they are being reviewed by the Case Review Subcommittee.
- 2. Motion. A motion by Chair Galloway that a letter be drafted by Member French and CPOA Legal Counsel to send to the Public Safety Committee Chair and City Council asking for a deferment on

Civilian Police Oversight Agency Board Minutes – December 9, 2021 Page 10 any action regarding the CPOA Ordinance for a period of 60 days. Roll call vote taken. Motion passed.

For: 5 - Crawford, French, Galloway, Kass, Nixon

- i. Consideration of Executive Director Resignation Acceptance Letter Chair Galloway
 - **1. Motion.** A motion by Chair Galloway to issue the letter to the former Executive Director. (*see attached*) Roll call vote taken. Motion passed.

For: 4 – Crawford, French, Galloway, Kass

Against: 1 - Nixon

- j. Consideration of Supplemental Questions for CPOA Executive Director Applicants
 - Motion. A motion by Member Dr. Kass to table Consideration of Supplemental Questions for CPOA Executive Director Applicants. Roll call vote taken. Motion passed.

For: 5 - Crawford, French, Galloway, Kass, Nixon

- k. Consideration of Changes to Proposed Timeline and Process for CPOA Director Appointment
 - Motion. A motion by Member Dr. Kass to table Proposed Timeline and Process for CPOA Director Appointment. Roll call vote taken. Motion passed.

For: 5 - Crawford, French, Galloway, Kass, Nixon

- Consideration of Communications to Stakeholder Groups on CPOA
 Executive Director Appointment
 - Motion. A motion by Member Dr. Kass to table Consideration of Communications to Stakeholder Groups on CPOA Executive Director Appointment. Roll call vote taken. Motion passed.

For: 5 – Crawford, French, Galloway, Kass, Nixon

m. Budget Process and Requests – Diane McDermott, Interim Executive Director

- Diane McDermott Interim Director provided information/deadlines on the upcoming budget process. Ms. McDermott also asked the CPOA Board for support on the potential expansion of CPOA office space.
- 2. Motion. A motion by Dr. Kass that Chair Galloway draft a letter to City Council with a copy to CAO that the CPOA Board supports expansion of CPOA office space. Roll call vote taken. Motion passed.

For: 5 - Crawford, French, Galloway, Kass, Nixon

- n. Update on Board Requested Training Diane McDermott, Interim

 Executive Director
 - -Robert Rules of Order Training
 - -City Legal Board Training
 - -CPOA Investigative Training
 - Diane McDermott Interim Director provided an update on the requested trainings and will provide the CPOA Board with an CPOA Investigation Training plan next month.

o. Changes to Initial Training

1. Motion. A motion by Chair Galloway to table Changes to Initial Training to the next regularly scheduled CPOA Board meeting. Roll call vote taken. Motion passed.

For: 5 – Crawford, French, Galloway, Kass, Nixon

- p. Draft January June 2021 Semi-Annual Report *Diane McDermott*, *Interim Executive Director*
 - 1. Diane McDermott Interim Director noted that the Draft January June 2021 is uploaded for Board review and the item will be on the January 2022 Board agenda for approval.

- q. Board Member Responsibilities Eric Olivas
 - -New Member Training Requirements
 - -8 Hour Annual Training Requirement
 - -Annual Board Member Review Meetings
 - 1. Chair Galloway provided an update on New Member trainings and noted that Member Crawford and French are up to date on their trainings where they are expected to be at this point.
 - **2.** Chair Galloway requested that Board members forward her and CPOA Legal Counsel any training documentation.
 - 3. Diane McDermott Interim Director noted that the virtual NACOLE trainings viewing availability will end on December 31, 2021 and requested input from Board members on any changes to the initial trainings proposal that was provided to Board Members.

XII. Meeting with Counsel re: Pending Litigation or Personnel Issues:

Closed Discussion and Possible Action re: Pending Litigation or Personnel Issues

- a. Limited personnel matters pursuant to NMSA 1978, Section 10-15-1(H)(2)
 - 1. None.

XIII. Other Business

- **a.** Member French expressed concern related to different platforms utilized to access materials.
- **b.** Member Nixon would like the Board to reconsider Member Ralphs resignation and he will reach out to her to discuss the circumstances surrounding her resignation.

XIV. Adjournment.

a. Motion. A motion by member Kass to adjourn the meeting. Roll call vote taken. Motion passed.

For: 5 - Crawford, French, Galloway, Kass, Nixon

b. The meeting was adjourned on Friday, December 10 at 12:10 a.m.



ATTACHMENTS





Cuyahoga County Public Library

PUBLIC FAX COVER SHEET

*Please note this is a public fax machine. The Cuyahoga County Public Library is not responsible for the content or the privacy of the information transmitted.

This fax number does not receive faxes.

does not receive faxes.
Date: Wov & 2021 Time: Atunda
Send to: Vallerie Barola and
Attention: Oleveland Other gat
From: Text on the Ballot attacked
Total Pages (including cover sheet)
NOTES / COMMENTS FOR RECIPIENT: and CPD 1
If this Capy is Not clear entitled Transford relay an acher. Altho Im Sure you can gone it up "on line".
Thom Geraldine a message slome
stone

"CLEIELANN DIVISION OF POLICE".
WENDOWNER METER then Clement Felle Rept
1 24 on the Ballot nov 2 por
Proposed Charter Amendment (By Pellilon) 7HG CITY POLICE PARTY POLICE A City of Cleveland
A majority affirmative vote is required for passage. LIKE ALBU QUETLO
Small the Charter of the City of Cleveland be amended by amending and replacing existing Sections 115-1, 115-2, 115-3 and 115-4, and enacting new Sections 115-5 and 119-1 of the Charter to reorganize the Office of
Professional Standards as subordinate to the Civilian Police Review Board rather than the executive head of the police force; to require that the Civilian Police Review Board receive funding in an amount equal to at least 1% of the budget of the police force; to expand the dutles of the Civilian Police Review Board to include
issuing complaints alleging any misconduct by Cleveland police officers or Division of Police employees; to require a full and complete investigation of all complaints against Division of Police employees and any
additional allegations discovered in the investigation; to require the imposition of no less than the minimum discipline that the Civilian Police Review Board recommends against the police officer or employee unless the
executive head of the police force Imposes lesser discipline based on clear and convincing evidence establishing that the Civilian Police Review Board erred and the Civilian Police Review Board does not
overrule such lesser discipline; to prescribe termination as presumed discipline for certain conduct absent mitigating factors; to establish the Community Police Commission and provide for the appointment,
composition and qualifications of its members and their minimum compensation; to provide a minimum funding obligation of \$1 million for the budget of the Community Police Commission with annual increases
plus an amount equal to 0.5% of the annual police budget for grants to community-based groups; to provide for the duties of the Community Police Commission, which include serving as the final authority over the
sufficiency of discipline of Division of Police officers, serving as the final authority over Cleveland Division of Police policies and procedures and the Division's recruitment and examinations of police recruits and the Division's training of police officers, compiling and maintaining employee records, conducting advocacy and
outreach efforts, and biring its own legal counsel when it deems necessary; to provide for an Executive Director and minimum staffing levels for the Community Police Commission; to provide for the duties of the
Executive Director of the Community Police Commission, including contracting authority; and to provide that this amendment supersedes and controls over previously adopted Charter provisions, ordinances, and
collective bargaining agreements?
To reorganize the Office
of Professional Standards
as subardinate to the
of Professional Standards as subordinate to the Civilian Police Review Board"" Geneline THEIR OVERSIGNEY 3.
Board" " SAGARIN
Isram 1 THEIR OVERS/6
Geraldine THERE OVERGIT
here in CPRBILL DON BOOKER
ero Hio
1 100 100 001/11
ANOTHER LATER OF CONVOCUTED
RULES TO BOGGLE THE RATIONAL MINDING CONFUSION, REBELLION,
main= mixIDIFSS SUBMUSSION



Cuyahoga County Public Library

PUBLIC FAX COVER SHEET

*Please note this is a public fax machine. The Cuyahoga County Public Library is not responsible for the content or the privacy of the information transmitted.

This fax number does not receive faxes.

does not receive taxes.
Date: Sunday ov 7 2021
Time:
Send to: Clet your officials
Attention: (1) City Counal Court
Fax Number: ammission 30 POA-
From: BABC SC+ APS:
Total Pages (including cover sheet): MAYOR'S DEFICE
NOTES / COMMENTS FOR RECIPIENT: 100 34
The Cittached motor consideration
X Orucial to 11 11 day to
the Jam our "Econome, is
ON THE NRINK OF IT
WE) ContiNuE TO GO-ALONG-
WITH-THE-PROGRAM"/NORMESISTANCE

Fact Shee Offshore Corporate Loopholes Americans For Tax Fairness

SUBMITTED FOR PATIFU NOUT,

FACT SHEET: OFFSHORE CORPORATE
LOOPHOLES
Key Facts NOTES BY AMATO WHO
OVENTIME HAS COMPETTHEREPUBLICANT -1) TO PAC
Tax avoidance through offshore tax loopholes is a significant
reason why corporations) which paid one-third of federal revenues
60 years ago, now pay one-tenth of federal revenues.
(http://www.whitehouse.gov/sites/default/files/omb/budget/fy2015
'assets/hist02z2.xls) THE BANKING SYSTEM "WE" ARE "UNDER" IS A PRIVATE
U.S. corporations dodge \$90 billion a year in income taxes
(http://ctj.org/pdf/offshoreshell2014.pdf) by shifting profits to
subsidiaries— often no more than a post office box— in tax
havens. Com MERCIAL JURI STICTION. "OUR" "MONEY" IS BANKSTER CREDIT!
"OUR" MONEY 13 BANKSTER CIREBIT
U.S. corporations hold \$2.1 trillion in profits offshore Scrip1
(http://www.reuters.com/article/2014/04/09/us-usa-tax-offshore-
idUSBREA3729V20140409) — much in tax havens — that have not
been taxed in the U.S., REPUBLIC" DOES NOT CE EXIST. MAYDAY 1933 + HE General Electric, which uses a loophole for offshore financial
GE EXIST. MAYDAY 1933 +742
General Electric, which uses a loophole for offshore financial
profits, earned \$27.5 billion in profits from 2008 to 2012 but
(claimed tax refunds of \$3.1 billion.)
(http://www.ctj.org/corporatetaxdodgers/sorrystateofcorptaxes.ph
DEDOGITORS, THE MASONIC KILING
DEPOSITORS, TAKEN FROM KILING DEPOSITORS, THE MASONIC KILING Apple made \$74 billion from 2009-2012 on worldwide sales
(ayeluding the Americas) and paid almost nothing in taxon
(excluding the Americas) and paid almost nothing in taxes (http://www.levin.senate.gov/newsroom/press/release/subcommitt
iala 2 Killer The Collins
1966 ? KILLED THE "SILVER") CERTIFICATES & CONFISCATED
growing and the transfer of the first the state of the first of the fi

10/27/21, 9 11 AM

Fact Sheet: Offshore Corporate Loopholes - Americans For Tax Fairness

ee-to-examine-offshore-profit-shifting-and-tax-avoidance-by-apple- inc-/?section=alltypes) to any country.

26 profitable Fortune 500 firms paid no federal income taxes (http://ctj.org/ctjreports/2014/02/the_sorry_state_of_corporate_tax es.php#.U82Ly_ldWRM) from 2008-2012. 111 large, profitable corporations paid zero federal income taxes in at least one of those five years.

	Talking points PAKE SOLUTIONS.
1	Some may NOT KNOW THEY'RE FAKE. SOUL CAN DE SURE THE LARE MANAGED BY THOSE We should end tax breaks for corporations that ship jobs and with
ò	We should end tax breaks for corporations that ship jobs and
	profits offshore. It's time to invest in America and create jobs here. KNOW

- When big corporations use tax havens to dodge paying their fair share of taxes, the rest of us have to pick up the tab. Families pay higher taxes, get fewer services or we all get a bigger deficit.
- by the rules at a disadvantage. We need to level the playing field.

 AINT GOIN' TO HAPPEN WO A FIGHT BATT
- Corporations say our 35% corporate income tax rate is the highest in the world, which makes them uncompetitive and kills jobs. But corporations aren't paying too much in taxes; many pay too little. The typical American family paid more income taxes in one year than General Electric and dozens of other companies paid in five years. Many large, profitable corporations pay a tax rate of less than 20%, and some pay absolutely nothing for years. If the corporations pay less, you will have to pay more Corporations by their fair share too.

AINT GOING TO HAPPENSOLONG AS THIS 2(10)
NATION REMAINS UNDER A PRIVATE BANKSTEN

10/27/21, 9:11 AM

Fact Sheet: Offshore Corporate Loopholes - Americans For Tax Fairness

• Corporations say a repatriation tax holiday will enable them to bring profits home, invest and create jobs. When this was tried in 2004 it was an utter failure. Companies actually cut jobs, but they lined the pockets of big shareholders and corporate executives. A tax holiday gives tax breaks to corporations that have done the most to dodge paying their fair share of taxes.

> A BOGUS MISLEADING PHRASE WHICH CONTROCUING OPERATIONS -PERMIT "BISSENTERS" TO USE.

Many U.S. corporations use offshore tax havens and other accounting gimmicks to avoid paying as much as \$90 billion a year (http://ctj.org/pdf/offshoreshell2014.pdf) in federal income taxes. A large loophole at the heart of U.S. tax law enables corporations to avoid paying taxes on foreign profits until they are brought home. Known as "deferral," it provides a huge incentive to keep profits offshore as long as possible. Many corporations choose never to bring the profits home and never pay U.S. taxes on them.

This william and it a Large Loop there I much worse than the Deferral gives corporations enormous incentives to use accounting tricks to make it appear that profits earned here were generated in a tax haven. Profits are funneled through subsidiaries, often shell companies with few employees and little real business activity.

Effectively, firms launder U.S. profits to avoid paying U.S. taxes.

Loopholes used to shift U.S. profits to FIGHT.

U.S. firms can set up a subsidiary offshore, channel billions of dollars of profit through it and make the subsidiary "disappear" for U.S. tax purposes simply by "checking a box"

10/27/21, 9.11 AM

Fact Sheet: Offshore Corporate Loopholes - Americans For Tax Fairness

(http://www.levin.senate.gov/newsroom/press/release/senatorsintroduce-bill-to-close-offshore-tax-loopholes/?section=alltypes) on an IRS form.

- corporations can sell the right to patents and licenses at a low price to an offshore subsidiary, which then "licenses" back to the U.S. parent at a steep price the right to sell its products in America. The goal of this "transfer pricing" is to make it appear that the company earns profits in tax havens but not in the U.S. (http://www.forbes.com/2010/04/01/ge-exxon-walmart-business-washington-corporate-taxes.html)
- Wall Street banks, credit card companies and other corporations
 with large financial units can easily move U.S. profits offshore
 using a loophole known as the <u>"active financing exception."</u>
 (http://ctj.org/ctjreports/2012/08/dont_renew_the_offshore_tax_loopholes.php#.U8LiZbEYdOg)
- A U.S. corporation can do an "inversion")
 (http://americansfortaxfairness.org/files/CRS-Expatriation-Inversions-Mergers-Tax-Issues-5-27-14-2-1.pdf) by buying a foreign firm and then claiming that the new, merged company is foreign. This lets it reincorporate in a country, often a tax haven, with a much lower tax rate. The process takes place on paper— the company doesn't move its headquarters offshore and its ownership is mostly unchanged but it continues to enjoy the privileges of operating here while paying low tax rates in the foreign country.

How to solve the problem fore

Comer SAKE ESTABLISHMENT
OUTRLORD APPROVED

SOLUTIONS' -

4(10)

The simplest solution, is to end "deferral," as proposed by Sen. Bernie	
The simplest solution is to end "deferral," as proposed by Sen. Bernie Sanders (http://www.sanders.senate.gov/newsroom/recent-	
business/end-offshore-tax-havens) and Rep. Jan Schakowsky.	£
(http://schakowsky.house.gov/press-releases/statement-on-the-	アドウ
introduction-of-the-corporate-tax-fairness-act/) Corporations would	F
Spay taxes on offshore income the year it is earned, rather than	0
indefinitely avoid paying U.S. income taxes. This would also remove	>
Scincentives to shift U.S. profits to tax havens and it would raise \$600	山
Veincentives to shift U.S. profits to tax havens, and it would raise \$600 Shillion AMT GOINT TO HAPPEN TUST	AR
(http://ctj.org/ctjreports/2014/07/addressing_the_need_for_more_fede)	1/1/2
ral_revenue.php#.U7x4VbFUeo0) over 10 years.	2
Tral_revenue.php#.U7x4VbFUeo0) over 10 years. Congiless is guided by THE INTIVEDANKSTIANS Short of ending deferral, Congress should close the most egregious	57
loopholes such as "shock the hex " "transfer prining " the "	200
loopholes, such as "check the box," "transfer pricing," the "active	
financing exception" and corporate "inversions." It should also end the	5
loophole that lets firms deduct the cost of expenses from moving jobs)
and operations offshore if the profits earned from those activities	5
remain offshore and untaxed by the U.S. — saving \$60 billion	00
(http://americansfortaxfairness.org/files/ATF-Biggest-Revenue-Raisers-	
Sen. Carl Levin (D-MI) has introduced legislation, the Stop Tax Haven	
Sen. Carl Levin (D-MI) has introduced legislation, the Stop Tax Haven	
Abuse Act (S. 1533 (https://beta.congress.gov/bill/113th-Profile)	S
congress/senate-bill/1533)), that will close some of these loopholes. It	_
Will raise \$220 billion over 10 years. THEY-THE TWINL BANKS -	
(http://www.levin.senate.gov/newsroom/press/release/senators	
introduce-bill-to-close-offshore-tax-loopholes/? THERE'S NO	
> section=alltypes#sthash.vqK8XYKZ.dpuf	
(STOP EM!	
Corporations really want a "territorial"	
tax system ADELOWNED BY THE	
TOTAL ATTOM	
CUNDER A PRIVATE COMMERCIAL	
TIDE DICTION THE CANADA AL	
DOFS (NOT) USTAND" FOR THE "REPUBLIC"	
17 OF 3 17/1 OF 1 1 1/2 INC 1 INC	

Fact Sheet. Offshore Corporate Loopholes - Americans For Tax Fairness

Corporations don't just want to "defer" paying U.S., taxes on foreign profits. They want a "territorial" tax system [16] [HAVE 17] [WWW.cbpp.org/cms/?fa=view&id=3895] that eliminates all U.S. taxation of offshore profits. This would provide even more incentives for corporations to shift profits to offshore tax havens. A system in which U.S. corporations pay no U.S. income taxes on offshore profits would encourage U.S. firms to create 800,000 jobs overseas (http://taxprof.typepad.com/files/136tn0281.pdf) rather than in the U.S. A "FORECAST" OF WHAT'S TO COME U.S. A "FORECAST" OF WHAT'S TO COME THE U.

Because U.S. firms are officially holding \$2.1 trillion in untaxed profits (http://www.reuters.com/article/2014/04/09/us-usa-tax-offshore-idUSBREA3729V20140409) offshore, they are proposing a "repatriation tax holiday," which would allow them to bring that money home at a special low tax rate. Supporters say this would increase domestic investment, creating jobs.

A tax holiday was tried in 2004, when \$300 billion was brought home at a 5.25% tax rate, but it was a big failure. It did not increase domestic investment or create jobs, (http://www.google.com/url? sa=t&rct=j&q=&esrc=s&source=web&cd=2&cad=rja&uact=8&ved=0CC kQFjAB&url=http%3A%2F%2Fwww.fas.org%2Fsgp%2Fcrs%2Fmisc%2FR40178.pdf&ei=1KaeU46bFtW2yASOkoGwDg&usg=AFQjCNG868Tiiujr QX4DKwlz6OlufW0-

cg&sig2=17HbNEhCekfDOlWUQ2GS4g&bvm=bv.68911936,d.aWw) and the money was used largely for stock buybacks, dividends and executive bonuses. (http://www.nber.org/papers/w15023.pdf/) Also, a tax holiday costs more than it raises — it will lose \$100 billion

10/27/21, 9 11 AM

Fact Sheet: Offshore Corporate Loopholes - Americans For Tax Fairness -(http://americansfortaxfairness.org/files/JCT-Repatriation-Score-6-6-14.pdf) over 10 years. Worst of all, it rewards firms that use offshore tax loopholes, encouraging even more tax dodging in the future. PRE MEDITATED DESIGN, AINT CHANGE WITHOUT A **News Coverage** The Islands Treasured by Offshore Tax Avoiders, (http://www.nytimes.com/2014/06/06/business/the-islandstreasured-by-offshore-tax-avoiders, html) The New York Times For U.S. Companies, Money 'Offshore' Means Manhattan, (http://www.nytimes.com/2013/05/22/business/for-us-companiesmoney-offshore-means-manhattan.html? r=0) The New York Times SOVERN Switching Names to Save on Taxes, (http://www.nytimes.com/2014/04/04/business/switching-namesto-save-on-taxes.html) The New York Times G.E.'s Tax Strategies Let it Avoid Taxes Altogether, (http://www.nytimes.com/2011/03/25/business/economy/25tax.ht ml) The New York Times TALL Cash Abroad Rises \$206 Billion as Apple to IBM Avoid Tax, (http://www.bloomberg.com/news/2014-03-12/cash-abroad-rises-206-billion-as-apple-to-ibm-avoid-tax.html) Bloomberg News Britain Becomes Haven for U.S. Companies Keen to Cut Tax Bills, (http://www.reuters.com/article/2014/06/09/us-britain-usa-taxinsight-idUSKBN0EK0BF20140609) Reuters FOULL

Fact Sheet: Offshore Corporate Loopholes - Americans For Tax Fairness 10/27/21, 9:11 AM Apple's Web of Tax Shelters Saved It Billions Panel Finds, (http://www.nytimes.com/2013/05/21/business/apple-avoidedbillions-in-taxes-congressional-panel-says.html) The New York for Avoidance.' (http://www.nytimes.com/2013/05/26/opinion/sunday/a-is-fo avoidance.html?module=Search&mabReward=relbias%3Aw JONATHAN SIMON The New York Times Corporations and their Tax Shell Games: Crackdown, (http://www.latimes.com/opinion/editorials/la-edtaxes-eu-transfer-pricing-20140616-story.html) The Los Angeles. Times Tax Havens: International Tax Avoidance and Evasion (http://fas.org/sgp/crs/misc/R40623.pdf) Congressional Research for FOITHM PRESIDENTS WERE LODGEANING MASOMIC International Corporate Tax Rate Comparisons and Policy Implications, (http://www.fas.org/sgp/crs/mjsc/R41743.pdf) Congressional Research Service NOTICE Justice and U .U7-X47EYdOg) Citizens for

- The Sorry State of Corporate Taxes,

 (http://www.ctj.org/corporatetaxdodgers/sorrystateofcorptaxes.ph
 p) Citizens for Tax Justice THE CONGRESS MAN

 (SONTORS,) LINDBERG, HHE
- Don't Renew the Offshore Tax Loopholes,
 (http://ctj.org/ctjreports/2012/08/dont_renew_the_offshore_tax_loopholes.php#.U8LFpbGTF8H) Citizens for Tax Justice
 ATHER OF THE ANIATOR
- General Electric's Special Tax Loophole Lets Company Dodge
 Billions in Taxes, (http://americansfortaxfairness.org/files/ATFGeneral-Electrics-Special-Tax-Loophole-Lets-Company-DodgeBillions-In-Taxes-FINAL-4.docx) Americans for Tax Fairness
 CHANLES LIND BERG (REPORTED LY 185 Frame)
 SPORE OUT AND WAS
- The Fiscal and Economic Risks of Territorial Taxation,

 (http://www.cbpp.org/cms/?fa=view&id=3895) Center on Budget

 and Policy Priorities PUNISHED BY THE KIDNAPPING

 OF HIS BABY GRANDSON A-FITT
- Repatriation Tax Holiday Would Lose Revenue and Is a Proven Policy Failure, (http://www.cbpp.org/cms/?fa=view&id=4154)
 Center on Budget and Policy Priorities THE FAMILY

 PAID THE RAMDS OM THE
- Corporate Tax Rates And Economic Growth Since 1947, (http://www.epi.org/files/2013/ib364-corporate-tax-rates-and-growth.pdf) Economic Policy Institute Kin NAPPENS ABAN DONED THE BABY WHO
- Corporate Income Tax: Effective Tax Rates Can Differ Significantly from the Statutory Rate' (http://www.gao.gov/products/GAO-13-520) U.S. Government Accountability Office

DIED BEFORE HE COULD BEFOUND THAT SHUT UP CONGRESSMAN LIND DERG. AND ANY OTHERSWITD MIGHT SPEAK DUT IN THE U.S.

0/*0

https

Fact Sheet: Offshore Corporate Loopholes - Americans For Tax Fairness

Download this document in PDF format. (http://americansfortaxfairness.org/files/9-ATF-Offshore-Corporate-Tax-Loopholes-fact-sheet.pdf)

Drawn from Americans for Tax Fairness' 2014 Tax Fairness Briefing Booklet. (http://americansfortaxfairness.org/tax-fairness-briefing-

bookiet. (http://annericansiortaxiairness.org/tax-iairness-prieiing-
booklet/reports/2014/08/12/tax-fairness-briefing-booklet/)
booklet/reports/2014/08/12/tax-fairness-briefing-booklet/) WHO WAS IT APTLY SAID & (FILTING) WHO WE DON'T HANG TO GETHER WE SURELY WILL HANGSEPARATELY WO DISTRICT OF THE SEPARATELY
TEWEDON' HANG 1066 TO
SUDFIX WILL HANGSHARATED
WE Society of the second of th
WENTEN /SEPTEMENTED
Can MtMS
WRITTEN/SCHARLED COMMENTS
or and one of
BY Geraldine amato
phone ovailable for lectures/ ovailable for lectures/ to share what has been strong learned in the last learned in the last
the end
for for the this
evallable of har telle
-/ so - what o -
to shall last
Dogrand on the
MADS OF MY CLIC
learned in the 20 yEARS OF MY Life
WHAT TWE ALL OF US, -
1711 TWE ALL OF 903
WHAT LINE A FIN
SLADE DULIN
SHOULD HAVE BEEN SHOULD HAVE SIRST
7/2 3/10
TAMBIT IN
XI NO S OF OW!
20 THIS 10 TAY 6HT.
THE WOT NOW LEET WO ! NON! NO.
TYIN (TO(10)
Warmericansloctex Jaimes - briefish - booklettlercostrent and is nove-comparate - bayleombrief
######################################





Cuyahoga County Public Library

PUBLIC FAX COVER SHEET

*Please note this is a public fax machine. The Cuyahoga County Public Library is not responsible for the content or the privacy of the information transmitted. This fax number does not receive faxes.

Date: NOV 16 2020 Time:
Send to: Attite en Police Merse Met 1
Attention: VALEDIE BANCET
Fax Number: , 50 9 92 4 3777
From: Meral deve am at 2
Total Pages (including cover sheet).
NOTES / COMMENTS FOR RECIPIENT:
Flease rest meeting
Reas new mook
411 7 11 22

GERALDINE AMATO PLABITE COMMENT

BDGUS/JUSTICE AT DEPT. OS POLICE POWER DOESN'T W REGIME BUT DICTATE AN AUTHORITARIAN PICTATORIAL-TOTAL ITARVAN Æ WITHOUT ABSOLUTE COMMAND OF MEDICES INTERMATIONAL VIOULD HAV HI STORT WITH THE PASSAGE OF vernments" Cons A REPUBLIC'S ATTR MAIRTAINED TO HIS PATE. THE SEDERAL THE "REPUBLIC FUR MI INTERNAT STANDS FOR JURISDICTION F SAINGTON SIGNED ACT MISSED DY THE REPUBLIC'S CONTROL CIATION CONTROLLED OFERATIVES TRY TO CHHOLDTHE LAW OF THE REPUBLIC! BAR ASSOCI EXISTED EACH EPVBL FRIFF WOULD BE BACKED MEN OF LAGE RESERVETANAGE ADULT! NOT LIKE IN THIS COMMERCIAL JURISPICTION USUCC, ETC. ETC. ETC,

Submotted By GERALDINE AMATO 2021 AUTHOR'S I CAME ACROSS IN THE 1990'S RE: POLICE WORK USA

RETIRED MINNERPOLIS POLICE CHIEF BOUZA IN HIS POLLDER PUFF CRITICUE: "THE PELICE MITSTIGUE" HE CAME REAL CLOSE TO THE TRUTH WHEN HE CRIMINAL EXISTS AGAINST CRIMINAL ACTIVIT 1.0 TICED AS AN HE TESTICIED HE NEVER 1.0 TICED A IN THE MENIALTIN DAY CARE COUERED LIP AS HE AS PRIVATE X POLICE DEPART IN ENT PUBLISHED WITH HIS 2000 " INTECESTINGLED THE ARIZ COURTS REINSTATED TREMENT BTHAT P.P.D. CANCELLED WHICH THE MAN NSTA il/ HOW HIS WORK PRESS, DESCRUBED KINGPINS A. DRUG C 111 WAS UNDONE (A) 114E Ris < 0f LIMB TO FOLKS SUPPORTING 5" (ADIT. ITIESTRATORS STITUTION MAI AMERICAN PEOPL HAD NO PUBLISHING IT. A WITHOR PAID TO HAVE IT PUT OUT IN LIHIS WAS BEFORE AVAILABLITY OF "WEB" PUBLISH AMATO) DETTER SAID" BARASSO (ONTROLLEDOPERTIVES" BOOK MAY HAVE CINES BEEN SEWSKI'S FINAL "ENTERNA TICIVAL "NET" NOBOOK SAPPEAR. BURNING KEDVIREIN

下01750m0灶年3555555183至183至50183至50183至50183至183至183至183至183至183至183至183至183至183至
WITH THE KLU KLUX WITH THE KLU KLUX WITH THE KLU KLUX SIGNATURE OF THE SIGNATURE SIGNATURE OF THE THE OWN SIGNATURE THE TIS WHATIAND THE TIS WHATIAND THE TIS WHATIAND THE TIS WHATIAND THE TAND WHE RUNS THE KKK THE TIS WHATIAND THE TAND WHE RUNS THE KKK THE TIS WHATIAND THE TAND WHE RUNS THE KKK TOWN THE TAND THE KKK THE TAND THE KAND THE TAND WHE RUNS THE KKK THE TAND WHE RUNS THE KKKK THE TAND WHE RUNS THE KKKK THE TAND WHE RUNS THE KKKKKKKKKKKKKKKKKKKKKKKKKKKKKKKKKKK

THE SCOTTISH IKITE MODE

COUERT BROTHERHOOD

ALONG WITH THE

LESS SHOWT YORK

RITE - HAS TAKEN

OUER THE HELM OF

COUER THE HELM OF

COUERTY FORMALLY

THE MAJORITY OF FOLKS

WITHIN THE CONTRULED.

THE MAJORITY OF FOLKS

WITHIN THE CONTRULED.

THE MAJORITY OF FOLKS

WITHIN THE CONTRULED.

THE MAJORITY OF FOLKS

WHITHIN THE CONTRULED.

THE MAJORITY OF FOLKS

WHITHIN THE FOR THE MOVEMENT

OR GANIZED FORTH

THE MAJORITY OF FOLKS

OF PROMINANT FIGURES

工

TH CAN BE REASONABLY
CONCLUDED THAT THESE
"WAR" ENGAGE MENTS
ARE HUMPIN SACRIFICE
RITUALS. WERE THESE
WARS, ARMED FIGHTING
BETWEEN DECLARED
BETWEEN DECLARED
BETWEEN DECLARED
WARS, ARMED FIGHTING
BETWEEN DECLARED
BETWEEN DECLARED
WARS, ARMED FIGHTING
BETWEEN DETERMING
THER, DETERMING
TO HER, DETERMINING
TO HER, TREACHERT
HOW TO STOP THISTREACHERT
WOULD REQUIRE AN A CONTRACTION

From:

1

Come correct adjockment that a correct and continue of a correct when the common of a correct that should be a common of a correct that a correct mode of a correct that a

PUBLIC COMMENT. FOR GOVERNMENT AND "GENERAL" UBUC HOLDERS on Your CONSi 3016 BROKVIEW ABSOLUTEL

DEC 3 2021 Geraldine amato

MY TRUE TESTIMON WILL NEVER INITIATE NOR COOPERATE WITH AGAINST ANYONE FOR RE: PRINCIPLES MAD "REASON! NOR AMERICAN B FROM ANY SUCH INDIVIDUALS, W J"SCHOOLS GRADULATE MAT HAVE IN MIND THE MPHOLDING OF "LAW" WITH for public comment HONOR AND INTEGRITY, BUT THE A.B. A. PROHIBITS THAT. IN FACT IT RIDS IT'S RANKS OF ANY "ATTORNE Y" WHO PERSISTEMLY BOAT" BY LALUMETHOUS PREZ, GED. WASHINGT H BRITISH ARISTOCRAC

JOULD NOT. WOULD NOT. THE C"HEARING" ABOUT

o: .

REPUBLIC TEA. B. A, THE AD.A, ETC. WOULD INCORPORAT OLUMBIA HEDERAL RE THE BRUTISH MON NOT, THE INCORPORATED "MUNICIPAL THE MAKOR AND "PROSECUTING" 1090 0+ TOTHER DESK! COURT KEPT SECRET EXCEPT BY HE PRESIDENT -tWYERS, S. AT EVERT "LEVEL". "HEARINGY PERFORMIN TUS EXECUTING JUSTICE WITH ON O From:

Jim Larson

Sent:

Wednesday, December 8, 2021 2:00 AM

To:

POB

Subject:

Public Comment regarding CPC#115-21 Request to Reopen the Complaint

External

The Agenda for the CPOA Board meeting on December 9, 2021 provides the following Instructions for making general public comment and comment on the meeting's specific agenda items in written form via email through 4:00 pm on Thursday, December 9, 2021. Submit your public comments to: POB@cabq.gov. These comments will be distributed to all CPOA Board members for review.

I am submitting these comments early in hopes they will be distributed to the Board with sufficient time for them to receive them prior to considering their position on the reopen request for CPC #115-21 that is on the agenda. I am also requesting that the comments be included as part of the published minutes. This comment was written to comply with the 5 minute presentation were I to have verbally presented it.

Chairman Olivas and Honorable Board Members.

Thank you for the opportunity to submit this public comment summarizing my concerns supporting the request to reopen CPC #115-21.

The Board response to my original request to reopen this complaint referred instead to a request for reconsideration for a hearing. I submitted a second email restating the request to re-open the complaint, not for a hearing. Both emails contain detailed support for the reopening and further investigation.

Administratively Closing the Complaint

- The Monitor's admonition in IMR-14 captures the essence of the CASA, requirements reflected in the city ordinance and Board policy and procedures for administratively closing a case when he said, "once again stressed that the administrative closing practice should only be utilized where the preliminary investigation shows, by clear and convincing evidence, that the allegations of misconduct did not occur and shows no indication of misconduct not related to the original complaint that would require further investigation."
- The city ordinance, and Board's policies also consistently cite similarly established requirements for administrative closure from the CASA that require in addition to determining if personnel the alleged misconduct, administrative investigations shall assess and document [...] whether the incident suggests the need for a change in policy, procedure, or training."
- A single incident was an 80-word paragraph selected and used by the CPOA to summarize the entire complaint from among other issues and incidents in the complaint. And in that incident the officer no longer worked for APD, and that fact was used to justify administratively closing the entire complaint. The CPOA report also states "Mr. Larson provided several other dates in reference to APD Officers having interaction with Ms. Cruz and James" and closed with "In reference to the other concerns, they were reviewed, and additional information is located in the investigative file."

- This closure does not fall within clearly defined circumstances of when its use is allowed. Its use also circumvents the additional requirements to evaluate a need for a change in policy, procedure, or training.
- The Board's use of admin closure in this case misapplied policies in the evaluation of the complaint. The Board's failure to ensure conduct of further investigation consistent with clearly defined requirements in admin closure complaints was arbitrary, capricious, and constituted an abuse of discretion. I am not requesting a reconsideration for a hearing.

The CPOA Investigative Letter

- The City Ordinance requires that "In addition to the findings and recommendation, each investigation report shall at a minimum also include: a section outlining any relevant background and facts relating to the matter, a listing of any relevant policies, procedures, or practices that are at issue, and an analysis of the issues in the case.
- The CASA and Board Policy and Procedures adds to the ordinance the additional investigative requirement to assess and document whether the action(s) under review were in compliance with training and legal standards, and whether the incident suggests the need for a change in policy, procedure, or training.
- The CPOA report also states "Mr. Larson provided several other dates in reference to APD Officers having interaction with Ms. Cruz and James" and closed with "In reference to the other concerns, they were reviewed, and additional information is located in the investigative file."
- The Board can gain access to the full investigative file when it deems it necessary. I found no request for access to review the CPOA investigative file in the past Board minutes. I assume the investigative file was not reviewed.
- This complaint along with three others were a single agenda item, Administratively Closed Cases. Without any discussion, the Board approved the administrative closure of all four, in 52 seconds. 52 seconds to consider the APD responses to numerous calls involving abuse and neglect ultimately resulting in the beating death of a 4-year-old boy.
- It is my view the Board decision to approve the CPOA report in this case did not have the meaningful information needed to make a reasoned judgment for approval.
- The IMR-14 monitoring team expressed that "the Board can offer valuable insight and community perspective to policy, training, and data and trend analysis that would be a very positive development in enhancing civilian oversight of police matters. We [the monitoring team) urge the Board to find the time to increase its efforts in this regard."
- · I urge the Board to re-open this complaint and request the CPOA provide a new report, consistent with CASA, city ordinance, and Board policies, including new information from the RTCC CADS I provided as well as addressing the reference to the other concerns, that were reviewed but not reported.
- · I also urge the Board to review the investigative file before considering any further report from the CPOA regarding this complaint.

What you allow, you condone.

Thank you. Jim Larson

Number	Title	Disposition	Recommendation
1-5	Harassment/Sexual Harassment in the Workplace	Advanced	No Rec
1-67	MATF	Advanced	No Rec
1-82	(Currently 4-8) Property Crimes Reporting Technician	Archived, duties transferred	No rec
1-85	(Currently 6-2) Recruiting Unit	Advanced	No Rec
1-93	Telephone Reporting Unit	Advanced	No Rec
2-87	Graffiti	Archived, not used	No Rec
2-90	(Currently 6-2) Background Investigations	Advanced	No Rec

CIVILIAN POLICE OVERSIGHT AGENCY Civilian Police Oversight Agency Board

Chantal M. Galloway, Chair

Jesse Crawford

Patricia French

Dr. William J. Kass

Eric Nixon

Diane McDermott, Interim Executive Director

December 9, 2021

Harold Medina, Chief of Police Albuquerque Police Department 400 Roma NW Albuquerque, NM 87102

Recommendation: SOP 3-41 Complaints Involving Department Personnel

Dear Chief Medina:

The Civilian Police Oversight Agency Board (CPOAB) is recommending several changes to SOP 3-41 which will allow the Civilian Police Oversight Agency (CPOA) to refer minor civilian police complaints (class sanction 6 or 7), at the discretion of the Executive Director, to the respective Area Command for investigation. This would only include first and second offense violations of class 6 and 7 that involves minimum, presumptive and maximum discipline to not include suspension. Minor policy violations involve conduct, that if sustained, would result in discipline or corrective action less severe than a suspension based on the Chart of Sanctions identified in SOP 3-46 Discipline System.

The CPOA receives significant number of complaints that even if investigated, will lead to minor discipline (verbal or written reprimand). The current CPOA investigative team is short staffed that does not allow a timely investigation for all complaints received. This practice will allow the CPOA to focus on more severe allegations and will help alleviate the concerns regarding investigative timelines. The timeliness for completing complaint investigations has been criticized by the Independent Monitoring Team in the recent monitoring reports. Also, this will benefit APD since the monitor criticized several investigations conducted by the area command as 'deficient' in the most recent report. The final review of the civilian complaint investigations by area command will be done by the CPOA, which in turn will allow for another set of eyes to review the final work product of the area command investigation. The CPOA Board hereby recommend changes in SOP 3-41 that will allow the CPOA to have the same criteria for assignment of civilian complaints as done by the Internal Affairs Professional Standards. Recommended language and placement of the language in SOP 3-41 will include the following;

In section 3-41-5 (Civilian Police Complaints), to add C. "Assignment of Civilian Police Complaints (CPC)" to include;

- 1. All civilian complaints shall be investigated by a CPOA Investigator, an IA Investigator, a designated supervisor, or an external contract investigator approved by the City of Albuquerque purchasing guidelines.
- 2. The CPOA has the discretion to refer complaints involving minor policy violations to a commander/division head for investigation and recommended findings.
- a- A complaint requiring the interviews of multiple witnesses and Department personnel from various assignments or extensive documentation retrieval shall be investigated by the CPOA.
- b- If the subject employee's record demonstrates that a sustained violation could result in suspension, the CPOA shall investigate the complaint.
- c- Rules regarding supervisory investigations of minor policy violations include:
- i. A supervisor shall not investigate the complaint if the supervisor:
- 1- was involved in the incident, including use of force incidents;
- 2- was involved in the actions that are the subject of the complaint;
- 3- authorized the actions that are the subject of the complaint; or
- 4- is a witness to the incident that is the subject of the complaint.
- ii. If a supervisor has been assigned an investigation and falls under one of these rules, the supervisor shall notify the CPOA in order to have the investigation reassigned.
- d-Review and final approval of the investigative findings and recommendations of the appropriate discipline shall be completed by the CPOAD irector and approved by the CPOAB.

Thank you for your consideration. We look forward to your response to our recommendations above, in compliance with your obligations under §9-4-1-4(C) (5) (c) of the Civilian Police Oversight Agency Ordinance.

Sincerely, The Civilian Police Oversight Agency Board by

Chantal Galloway
Chantal M. Galloway, Chair

cc: Civilian Police Oversight Agency

MEMORANDUM OF UNDERSTANDING BETWEEN ALBUQUERQUE POLICE OFFICERS ASSOCIATION AND THE CITY OF ALBUQUERQUE REGARDING CIVILIAN POLICE OVERSIGHT BOARD ACCESS TO OFFICER IDENTIFYING INFORMATION

THIS **MEMORANDUM OF UNDERSTANDING** ("MOU") is entered into by and between the City of Albuquerque ("City"), the Albuquerque Police Officers' Association ("APOA"), the Civilian Police Oversight Agency ("CPOA"), and the Civilian Police Oversight Agency Board ("Board") (collectively referred to as the "Parties").

WHEREAS, the City and APOA have entered into a Collective Bargaining Agreement ("CBA");

WHEREAS, pursuant to the Police Oversight Ordinance, Revised Ordinances of Albuquerque, New Mexico, 1994, §§ 9-4-1-1 to 9-4-1-14 ("Ordinance"), the CPOA was established "as an independent agency of city government, not part of either the city administration or City Council [which] consists of the Civilian Police Oversight Agency Board (the 'Board') and an Administrative Office led by the CPOA Executive Director";

WHEREAS, the CBA allows the City and APOA to enter into written MOUs to change or amend policies that would be in conflict with the CBA (CBA, Section 32.3);

WHEREAS, the Parties desire to enter into an agreement that: protects officer identifying information from disclosure to the public; enables the City, CPOA, and Board to comply with the Ordinance; enables the City, CPOA and Board to comply with the requirements of the Court-Approved Settlement Agreement ("CASA") entered in *United States v. City of Albuquerque*, 14-cv-1025 (Doc. 465-1); and does not jeopardize any criminal investigation due to public disclosure of information obtained by administrative investigators but precluded from use in criminal proceedings pursuant to *Garrity v. New Jersey*, 385 U.S. 493 (1967);

WHEREAS, a compelled statement is a statement provided by an officer to an officer's employer if the statement is compelled under threat of dismissal from employment or any other employment sanction (State v. Chavarria, 2001-NMCA-095); compelled statements cannot be used in subsequent criminal prosecutions (Garrity v. New Jersey, 385 U.S. 493 (1967)); and the CBA states that information from a compelled statement shall not be made public by the City (CBA, Section 20.1.10);

WHEREAS, the CBA further states that any information released to the Board shall not contain information that identifies sworn department personnel (CBA, Section 20.1.10);

WHEREAS, pursuant to Ordinance, the "Board shall . . . review and approve or amend the findings and conclusions of all investigations completed by the Administrative Office" (Ordinance, § 9-4-1-4);

WHEREAS, pursuant to the Ordinance, the Albuquerque Police Department ("APD") "shall provide Board members, the Director, and CPOA staff reasonable access to APD premises, files,

documents, reports and other materials that are reasonably necessary for the agency to perform thorough, independent . . . reviews of serious uses of force and officer-involved shootings" (Ordinance, § 9-4-1-4(C)(3)(b));

WHEREAS, the CASA requires the CPOA to conduct thorough and independent reviews of APD's serious uses of force and officer-involved shootings, and further requires all of the findings made by the Executive Director in conjunction with such reviews to be forwarded to, and reviewed by, the Board (CASA, ¶279 – 282);

WHEREAS, the CASA requires that the "City shall provide the agency, its investigative staff, and the Executive Director access to . . . the identities of officers involved in incidents under review" (CASA, ¶ 282(b));

WHEREAS, so that the Board may conduct its reviews, the CASA requires the City to "provide reasonable access to APD premises, files, documents, reports, and other materials for inspection by those appointed to the agency, its investigative staff, and the Executive Director upon reasonable notice" (CASA, ¶ 283);

WHEREAS, the CASA further requires the following: "The City, APD, and the agency shall develop protocols to ensure the confidentiality of internal investigative files and to ensure that materials protected from disclosure remain within the custody and control of APD at all times" (CASA, ¶ 284);

WHEREAS, the attempts by APD to redact officers' faces, name tags, and oral references to officers' names from on-body recording device recordings has been excessively burdensome and time consuming; and

WHEREAS, the City and the APOA have agreed to supplement the CBA currently in effect, and the Parties have agreed to enter into this inter-departmental agreement to further the goals of compliance with the CBA, Ordinance, and CASA, and to ensure protection of officer identities while also ensuring the prompt required sharing of records and materials between APD and the CPOA and Board;

NOW, THEREFORE, the parties agree to the following:

I. TERM OF MOU.

The Parties agree that, so long as all Parties sign this MOU, the "effective date" is the date that the last party executes this MOU and shall remain in full force until February 1, 2023, but may be extended or incorporated into a successor CBA.

II. RELEASE OF INFORMATION BY THE CITY TO THE CPOA AND BOARD.

A. Prior to the Force Review Board ("FRB"), APD will provide to the CPOA Executive Director all documents provided to the FRB, including investigative recordings that contain compelled statements. The Executive Director shall not submit any documents

- or evidence containing compelled statements to the Board; instead, the Board shall comply with the provisions of § 9-4-1-4(C)(3)(d) to review these recordings.
- B. After the FRB completes its review of any serious use of force or officer-involved shooting, APD shall provide the following information to the CPOA Executive Director, who shall release such information to the Board:
 - 1. All written documents and evidence provided to the FRB, excluding administrative interview(s) of the officer(s) under investigation.
 - a. All documents will be redacted by APD in accordance with *Garrity* and the Ordinance, § 9-4-1-4(C)(3)(b) and (d), prior to being provided to the Executive Director for production to the Board; and
 - 2. On-Body Recording Device ("OBRD") recordings, security recordings, other audiovisual recordings, and audio recordings that do not contain compelled statements.
 - a. Officer names, nametags, and faces will not be redacted from these videos unless the officers are working under cover.

III. CONFIDENTIALITY OF INFORMATION.

- A. The Parties agree that Section 20.1.10 of the CBA, which states that information from a compelled statement shall not be made public by the City, applies to the CPOA and Board, as agencies of the City.
- B. The Parties agree each of them shall maintain the confidentiality of the identities of all officers as required by the CBA, Ordinance, and CASA, to the extent allowed by law. Accordingly, the CPOA and Board shall not:
 - 1. Release any records containing officer identities;
 - i. Any access to information provided to the CPOA and Board as set forth in this MOU must be obtained through a public records request. If the CPOA or Board receives a request, they will forward said request to the City Clerk's Office.
 - ii. Nothing in this paragraph shall inhibit the City Clerk's office from complying with the provisions of the Inspection of Public Records Act, N.M.S.A. 1978, §§ 14-2-1 to 14-2-12;
 - 2. Intentionally identify any officer during a public meeting;
 - 3. Play, display, quote from, cite from, or otherwise discuss any recording, document or evidence in a public meeting if doing so would show any officer's face or disclose any officer's identity; or
 - 4. Download, record, copy, or retain access to OBRD videos used to conduct reviews of serious uses of force or officer-involved shootings.

IV. NO FURTHER AGREEMENT.

This MOU incorporates all the agreements, covenants, and understandings between the Parties hereto concerning the matters addressed in this agreement, and all such agreements, covenants and understandings have been merged into this MOU. This MOU expresses the entire MOU and understanding between the parties on the matters described above. No prior agreement or understanding, verbal or otherwise, of the Parties or their agents shall be valid or enforceable unless embodied in this MOU.

V. SEVERABILITY.

In case any one or more of the provisions contained in this MOU or any application thereof shall be invalid, illegal, or unenforceable in any respect, the validity, legality, and enforceability of the remaining provisions contained herein and any other application thereof shall not in any way be affected or impaired thereby.

VI. Review, Revision, or Termination of MOU

This MOU shall remain in effect unless and until it is terminated by the Parties. Any request to modify or revise this agreement must be submitted in writing and any modification or revision must be agreed to in writing by the Parties' representatives. Any Party may terminate this agreement by written notification submitted to all participating Parties.

WITNESS WHEREOF, the Parties have executed this agreement which becomes effective as of the date of approval of the final signatory.

Esteban A. Aguilar, Jr. City Attorney	DATE
John J. D'Amato Counsel for APOA	DATE
Fred Mowrer Counsel for APOA	DATE
Dianne McDermott Acting Director, CPOA	DATE
Eric Olivas President, CPOA Board Chair	DATE

CITY OF ALBUQUERQUE



Patricia French



CIVILIAN POLICE OVERSIGHT AGENCY

Civilian Police Oversight Agency Board

Chantal M. Galloway, Chair Dr. William J. Kass

Jesse Crawford

Eric Nixon

Diane McDermott, Interim Executive Director

December 9, 2021

Honorable James O. Browning United States District Court Pete V. Domenici United States Courthouse 333 Lomas Blvd NW, Suite 660 Albuquerque, New Mexico 87102

Re: CPOA Board Issues for Consideration in Anticipation of December 16, 2021 Public Hearing

Dear Judge Browning:

We are writing on behalf of the Civilian Police Oversight Agency (CPOA) Board. Thank you for this opportunity to address some significant issues that continue to pose long-term concerns (i.e. unfilled CPOA Board positions and deteriorating Board morale), and challenges the CPOA Board is currently experiencing regarding accessing specialized training and APD's Serious Use of Force (SUOF) materials. All of these issues are being evaluated by the Monitor, and, with regard to the Board composition issues, have been Albuquerque ongoing concerns for years.

CPOA BOARD MORALE

NM 87103

The CPOA Board's morale is at a recent low. Particularly concerning are the statements and efforts of the City. The City has made inaccurate public statements. including statements by both the City Attorney and City Councilors, to the effect that the CPOA Board holds the lives and livelihoods of officers in their hands. These claims are ill-informed and undermine an already weak oversight process. Further, the CPOA Board has no power to affect officer discipline or APD policy beyond advisory recommendations.

www.cabq.gov

The CPOA Board's perception is that the CASA parties' actions have undermined its independence by offering criticism of the Board, its members, and its operations. For example, despite providing evidence to the contrary, the City Attorney produced and presented a report on CPOA Board member training to the City Council that was inconsistent with records provided by the CPOA Board. In IMR-14, the Monitor has questioned the authenticity of CPOA Board Members' verification of having completed required training when approximate dates were provided. Given that in some cases it had been over 2 years since Board members completed the initial training and the records maintained by CPOA of these trainings were incomplete, this seems to be a form over substance position.

The CPOA Board recognizes and embraces its role in the reform process. It acknowledges its shortcomings and has implemented meaningful solutions to address real issues with its performance and compliance. The CPOA Board recognizes that it must be in a position to function as the monitor when the CASA is complete and it is committed to achieving this goal. It implores those involved in the process to work with it to ensure that the CPOA Board can assume this role when the time comes.

TIMELY ACCESS TO SUOF MATERIALS

The CPOA Board reviews all SUOF investigations. CASA, ¶ 280; see also generally Albuquerque Ordinance, § 9-4-1-4(C). Both the CASA and Albuquerque Ordinance specifically require that the CPOA Board be provided "access to all APD documents, reports, and other materials that are reasonably necessary for the agency to perform thorough, independent investigations of civilian complaints and reviews of serious uses of force and officer-involved shootings." CASA, ¶ 280; see also Albuquerque Ordinance, § 9-4-1-4(C)(3) ("APD shall provide Board members, the Director, and CPOA staff with reasonable access to APD premises, files, documents, reports and other materials that are reasonably necessary for the agency to perform thorough, independent investigations of civilian complaints and reviews of serious uses of force and officer-involved shootings.").

The CPOA Board is pleased to report that the technology issues that originally arose with CPOA Board review of FRB presentations and SUOF investigations have largely been remedied. Still, the APOA has demanded that the City redact the OBRD videos—which takes a tremendous amount of APD time and resources. As they were during IMR-13, the City, APOA, and CPOA Board are still in the process of working towards acceptable solutions for SUOF cases. If these discussions are not successful, this is an issue that will warrant increased focus moving forward.

CPOA/CPOA BOARD STAFFING

The City's oversight ordinance states the CPOA Board shall have nine (9) volunteer members from a broad cross-section of the community (Albuquerque Ordinance 9-4-1-5(A)). It is the City Council's responsibility to appoint Board members (Albuquerque Ordinance, § 9-4-1-5(C)). For the better parts of 2018, 2019, 2020, and through March 2021, the Board had been operating with only six (6) members. While the CPOA Board was fully staffed for a short period of time during IMR-14, there are currently four unfilled positions and the selection process is not transparent. The appointment process for CPOA Board members needs to be clearly defined for the benefit of the public and for prospective CPOA Board members. Transparency should be of paramount importance. This Board requires a full complement to operate as effectively and efficiently as possible.

The CPOA also has significant staffing needs that need to be timely addressed—i.e. investigator positions, policy analyst, community engagement specialist. While it is the CPOA Board's understanding that the CPOA has diligently worked to fill these positions, it is facing delay and other procedural issues with City HR processes. Thus,

while the Monitor has expressed the need to fill these positions during IMR-15, it is unlikely that this will occur. The CPOA Board is hopeful that the City will take steps to remedy these delays so that the positions are filled during the IMR-16 period.

CPOA BOARD TRAINING

It is clear from IMR-14 that the CPOA Board training reporting process was lacking, and that training deficiencies cannot continue to occur. To ensure this is not an issue moving forward, the Board has implemented new training processes and procedures, along with a renewed focus on trying to streamline required trainings through ongoing Ordinance amendments. The CPOA Board is hopeful that these changes ensure this issue is remedied.

Again, the CPOA Board appreciates the opportunity to address the Court and will be available to address any questions or concerns at the upcoming status conference.

Sincerely,

locuSigned by:

Charital Galloway

Chantal Mir Galloway, Chair

Civilian Police Oversight Agency

ce via email:

AUSA Elizabeth M. Martinez
DOJ Trial Attorney Corey M. Sanders
Steve Aguilar, City Attorney
Frederick Mowrer, Counsel for APOA
James Ginger, Ph.D, Independent Monitor

CITY OF ALBUQUERQUE

Civilian Police Oversight Agency Board Civilian Police Oversight Agency Board

Chantal M. Galloway, Chair

Jesse Crawford

Dr. William J. Kass

Eric Nixon

Diane McDermott, Interim Executive Director



12/10/21

To Edward Harness,

This letter shall serve as acknowledgement indicating that the CPOA Board has accepted your resignation and any request to rescind or modify your resignation must be done according to City Personnel Rules and Regulations Section 801.

Thank you,

-Eric Olivas

CPOAB Chair

PO Box 1293

Albuquerque

NM 87103

www.cabq.gov